

OVERVIEW OF NURSES' TURNOVER INTENTIONS IN GOVERNMENT AND PRIVATE HOSPITALS IN BANDUNG CITY INDONESIA

Eva Supriatin¹, Thessa Bella², Suci Noor Hayati³, Diwa Agus Sudrajat⁴

^{1,2,3,4} Departement of Nursing, STIKep PPNI Jabar

Corresponding author: evatarisa@gmail.com

Received : 01 November 2024 ° Revised : 13 November 2024 ° Accepted : 19 November 2024

ABSTRACT

Aims: Turnover intention is an employee's intention to leave their job, being an early indicator that can predict actual turnover. Differences in compensation between the two types of hospitals also contribute to work motivation and service quality. Therefore, it is important for hospital management to identify nurse turnover intention as an early detection of turnover occurring. This study describes the turnover intention of nurses working in government hospitals and nurses in private hospitals

Methods: Participants were drawn from government and private hospitals in Bandung City, Indonesia. This sample size will be taken from a total population of 9,344 nurses in hospitals in Bandung City used the G*Power application totaling 345 participants. The sampling technique used was convenience sampling. The inclusion criteria were staff nurses, ward heads, and nurse team leaders working in direct care units with permanent employee status and more than one year of working experience in the research hospital. The instrument used was the Turnover Intention Scale (TIS)-6 by Roodt. The data were analyzed and interpreted using the Total Mean Score.

Result: The distribution of participants' assessment level of Turnover Intention in government hospitals as a whole averaged 2.60 with a moderate level. The dimensions of turnover intention that have a moderate level are motivation to look for another job and the possibility of getting a job outside. The overall average distribution of participants' assessment of turnover intention in private hospitals was 2.86 with a moderate level. The dimensions of turnover intention that have a moderate level are all dimensions, namely the possibility of resigning from the current job, motivation to look for another job, and the possibility of getting a job outside. Nurses in government hospitals tend to stay because of job stability and the benefits offered as civil servants, such as welfare and pension benefits, and a culture that makes civil service the dream of the majority of nurses in Indonesia. In contrast, nurses in private hospitals tend to show higher levels of turnover intention, which may be caused by dissatisfaction with working conditions and unmet personal needs. Private nurses were more likely to consider moving elsewhere due to factors such as job stress, lack of managerial support, and dissatisfaction with compensation.

Conclusions: Turnover intention among nurses in government and private hospitals shows different patterns, although both are at moderate levels. Nurses in government hospitals tend to have lower turnover intention than nurses in private hospitals.

Keywords : Nurse Turnover, Private Hospital, Government Hospital, Turnover Intention.

INTRODUCTION

Nurse turnover continues to be a global challenge for the healthcare sector. When a nurse leaves a hospital, it can be difficult for the hospital to find a replacement immediately. A report released by Nursing Solution, Inc (NSI) in the US in 2017 on turnover in healthcare revealed that it takes an average of 86 days to fill a vacant experienced nurse position, meaning an experienced nurse position will be vacant for almost 3 months (Nursing Solutions Inc, 2023).

Based on some research results, the turnover rate of nurses in Indonesia is quite high. Research conducted on nurses in several hospitals including by Muhadi & Angesti (2022) in Surabaya showed an increase in turnover in the last 5 years, and peaked in 2021 at 51%. Another study by Sabatini, et al., (2023) in Solo showed a continued increase in nurse turnover rates over the past 3 years by an average of 35%. Sukma et al., (2020) in their research showed an increase in the percentage of nurse turnover in the last 2 years 2018 and 2019, namely 35.7% and 38.5%. This shows

a high incidence of turnover, where according to Gillies the optimum number of nurse turnover is between 5 - 10% per year.

Turnover has a negative impact on an organisation, such as human resources, costs and employee motivation (Novliadi, 2007; Affandi, L., & Basukianto, B. 2014). Of course, the magnitude of the impact of turnover on nurses can reduce the quality of the hospital, resulting in fewer patients. Hospitals must incur additional costs for the recruitment and training process for new nurses. This creates financial problems for the hospital.

Hospital nurse turnover can be predicted through nurse turnover intention. Turnover intention is the intention or tendency of an employee to leave their job within a certain period of time (Fernandez et al., 2020). It is an early indicator that can predict actual turnover in the future. Turnover intention is often considered the main predictor of turnover. Research shows that individuals who have high levels of turnover intention are more likely to actually leave their jobs. This is due to job dissatisfaction and the desire to seek better opportunities. Zeffane (1994, in Halimah et al., 2016) states that turnover intention is an early indicator of actual turnover. The results of research by Michels & Spector (1982) and Motowildo (1983) in Affandi (2014) explain that turnover intention is the main predictor of turnover.

Turnover intention is the thought or plan of employees to leave an organisation (Lambert et al., 2013; Putri, L. O. K, 2021). Based on previous research conducted by Lorenza, F. P. (2020) in one of the private hospitals in Bandung City, it shows a high increase in turnover every year and 61% of nurses are in the high category of turnover intention, the results of the correlation test show a positive relationship between the level of turnover and the level of turnover intention of nurses in the hospital, Nurses who have the desire to leave have less motivation to work and increase absenteeism, thus affecting performance. This will also lead to laziness at work and not caring about work or workplace so that it will disrupt service

operations in the hospital. This will certainly have an impact on colleagues and the hospital. If this turnover intention is not addressed properly by hospital management, it can result in employee departure from the organisation (turnover).

The results of research conducted by Steffi et al., (2023), the factors that cause nurses to want to leave the hospital are the opportunities and rewards obtained from other hospitals. Other research conducted by Muharni & Wardhani, (2020) shows that work stress originating from the external and internal environment is related to nurse turnover intention. Psychological pressure caused by the perception of health workers can cause stress and fatigue, affect performance, efficiency and effectiveness, and tend to want to stop working (Kosnadi & Sartika, 2023).

Data from the results of research conducted by Yatnikasari, 2010 on nurses in one of the government hospitals in Jakarta showed that the reason for leaving the hospital was because 25% followed their husbands to work in other areas, 25% got a workplace closer to home, 12.5% switched professions, 12.5% moved to the Ministry of Health, 12.5% moved to another government hospital, and 12.5% returned to their area of origin. Other research results conducted by Muslim & Sutinah, 2020 on nurses with non-government employee status at one of the government hospitals in Surabaya showed that the reason for nurses to change jobs was due to a lack of career certainty and employee welfare. Meanwhile, Lorenza (2020) in her research in one of the private hospitals in the city of Bandung with a nurse turnover rate of over 40% every year, explained that 96% of nurses stated that the salary received at this time was not as expected, 90% of nurses stated that the incentives received at this time were not as expected, and 62% of nurses had not received appreciation for the work they had done well. This data has the potential to increase nurses' turnover intention.

The results showed that both nurses in government and private hospitals have reasons to leave the workplace and

have a tendency to move if there is a better opportunity, but private nurses may be more actively seeking new opportunities due to the nature of their contract work. Overall, the difference in rewards between private and government hospitals in Indonesia is striking, with private hospitals tending to offer more attractive and diverse compensation packages compared to government hospitals, but government hospitals provide certainty of welfare to nurses by providing benefits during retirement. This contributes to the different levels of work motivation and quality of health services between the two types of institutions.

Although turnover intention can be an early indicator of possible turnover, not all intentions to leave will be followed by concrete actions, but if left unchecked, actual turnover is very likely to occur. Understanding this dynamic, the first step that must be known is the level of turnover intention of nurses as an initial detection to determine the next step in improving retention efforts for nurses. Therefore, the researcher is interested in examining the turnover intention of nurses who work in government hospitals and nurses who work in private hospitals in Bandung City.

METHODS

The type of research used is descriptive quantitative. This study describes the turnover intention of nurses working in government hospitals and nurses in private hospitals over the past 9 months. Participants were drawn from government and private hospitals in Bandung City, Indonesia. This sample size will be taken from a total population of 9,344 nurses in hospitals in Bandung City.

The researcher used the G*Power application to analyze the number of participants included in the study. G*Power suggests 330 samples with a small effect size (0.1), 5% margin of error, and 99% power. The researcher has rounded the sample size to 345 participants.

The sampling technique used was convenience sampling. The inclusion criteria were staff nurses, ward heads, and nurse team leaders working in direct care

units with permanent employee status more than one year of working experience in the research hospital. Exclusion criteria: work less than 1 year, training / internship nurses, and middle manager nurses.

The researcher invited participants to volunteer for this study. Participants could complete the questionnaire electronically either at home and/or at the hospital. All nurses with different positions are likely to have turnover intention. Nurses can feel and assess their work and what they do after at least working for more than 1 year in an arena where they are directly involved.

The instrument used by researchers to measure turnover intention is Turnover Intention Scale (TIS)-6. This instrument was adopted from an instrument created by Michael and Spector (1982) and then developed by Roodt (2004). The researcher has sought permission and received approval to use this instrument. The instrument was translated into Indonesian and back translated and has been tested for content validity and reliability. The Cronbach's α of this scale is 0.76 and the content validity index is between 0.67 and 0.87. In other studies Cronbach's α of the scale was 0.83 and the α of the dimensions were 0.79, 0.63 and 0.72. (Hu et.al, 2022). The data will be organized, analyzed, and interpreted using the following statistical tools. Total Mean Score was used to analyze the levels of turnover intention.

Tabel 1. Scale for Interpreting the Means of turnover intention,

Mean Range	Data Interpretation
4.20 – 5.00	Very high
3.40 – 4.19	High
2.60 – 3.39	Moderate
1.80 – 2.59	Low
1.00 – 1.79	Very low

Statistical analysis will be performed using SPSS version 24.0. The collected data were calculated, analyzed, and processed using these tools. The researcher has obtained approval from the St. Paul University research ethics board. Ethical clearance was obtained from the St. Paul University Research Ethics Review Committee.

RESULTS

The participants in government hospitals, 53% were between 27-42 years old, referred to as generation Y, 70% were female, 70% had a diploma of nursing education, 70% were married, 72% were executive nurses and 73% had worked for more than 4 years. Meanwhile, 71.1% of participants in private hospitals were between 21-26 years old, referred to as generation Z, 73% were female, 71% had a

diploma of nursing education, 51% were married, 82% were executive nurses and 62% had worked for 1-2 years.

The distribution of participants' assessment level of Turnover Intention in government hospitals as a whole averaged 2.60 with a moderate level. The dimensions of turnover intention that have a moderate level are motivation to look for another job and the possibility of getting a job outside (Table 2).

Table 2. Distribution of the Mean Level of Participants' Assessment of Turnover Intention in government hospitals

Dimensions	Statement	Mean	Data Interpretation (DI)
the possibility of resigning from the current job	How often have you considered leaving your job	2.30	Low
	To what extent is your current job satisfying your personal needs		
motivation to look for another job	How often are you frustrated when not given the opportunity at work to achieve your personal work-related goals	2.82	Moderate
	How often do you dream about getting another job that will better suit your personal needs		
possibility of getting a job outside	How likely are you to accept another job at the same compensation level should it be offered to you	2.67	Moderate
	How often do you look forward to another day at work		
	Category Mean	2.60	Moderate

The overall average distribution of participants' assessment of turnover intention in private hospitals was 2.86 with a moderate level. The dimensions of turnover intention that have a moderate

level are all dimensions, namely the possibility of resigning from the current job, motivation to look for another job, and the possibility of getting a job outside (Table 3).

Table 3. Mean Distribution of Participants' Assessed Levels on Turnover Intention in private hospitals

Dimensions	Statement	Mean	Data Interpretation (DI)
the possibility of resigning from the current job	How often have you considered leaving your job	3.0	Moderate
	To what extent is your current job satisfying your personal needs		
motivation to look for another job	How often are you frustrated when not given the opportunity at work to achieve your personal work-related goals	2.82	Moderate

	How often do you dream about getting another job that will better suit your personal needs		
possibility of getting a job outside	How likely are you to accept another job at the same compensation level should it be offered to you	2.75	Moderate
	How often do you look forward to another day at work		
	Category Mean	2.86	Moderate

DISCUSSION

The results of this study are in line with the findings of Ismuntania (2018) and Agnes (2023) on government and private hospital nurses in Medan city who found that most nurses had moderate turnover intention. These results illustrate that government and private nurses both have the desire to leave their jobs although at a moderate level. This result shows that it does not mean that nurses do not have the desire to leave, this will have the opportunity for nurses to leave the hospital. If this happens, it can be bad for the hospital because it will incur greater costs for the recruitment and coaching process.

In the dimension of the possibility of resigning from the current job, the level of turnover intention in government hospital participants shows a low level, meaning that in this dimension nurses tend to stay or stay in their jobs. This is understandable for nurses in government hospitals, because being a government nurse is generally the desire of most nurses in Indonesia. Having certainty of welfare, career, and getting benefits in retirement is an attractive reason for most nurses. This is in line with the research of Sabatini et al. (2023), where government nurses tend to survive with their status as government workers.

The difference can be seen in participants from private hospitals, in the dimension of the possibility of resigning from the current job, the level of turnover intention shows a moderate level. This means that it is very likely that nurses have a desire to leave their current job, and there is a possibility that it is caused by the dissatisfaction of the current job in

fulfilling their personal needs. This is supported by the statements How often have you considered leaving your job and To what extent is your current job satisfying your personal needs which are at a moderate level. This is in line with Lorenza, F. P. (2020) in her research explaining that salary, incentives, and appreciation for a job well done are reasons for nurses to stay or leave their current job.

In the dimension of the motivation to look for another job, the level of turnover intention in government and private hospital participants shows a moderate level with the same mean score of 2.82, meaning that in this dimension nurses in both hospitals tend to want to leave their workplace or resign from their current job. This result shows that the motivation to look for another job is an intrinsic motivation to leave their job because they feel frustrated when they are not given the opportunity to achieve personal goals so they dream of getting another job that is more in line with their needs. Research by Muharni & Wardhani, (2020) explains that work stress originating from the external and internal environment can trigger nurse turnover intention. Psychological pressure caused by the perception of health workers can cause stress and fatigue, affect performance, efficiency and effectiveness, and tend to want to stop working (Kosnadi & Sartika, 2023).

Several studies have found that employees who have the intention to leave their jobs also have various motivations. Among them are discomfort, work stress, conflict in work and family, and better offers from other companies, (Chen et al., 2018; Asghar et al., 2018; Y. Zhang et al., 2020; Yukongdi & Shrestha, 2020).

Bahlaman's (2022) findings with nurses in the Netherlands through qualitative research found a deep and meaningful understanding of nurses' motivations for leaving the profession. Among them are poor working conditions, lack of opportunities for career development, lack of support from managers, work-related stress, mismatch between nursing education and practice, and bullying behaviour.

Kim et al, 2016 in their research stated that there is a negative influence between career growth on turnover intentions. The study explains that organisations that are able to provide good career opportunities to employees will make these employees stay in the organisation, but if the organisation is unable to meet employee career growth, turnover intentions will be higher. Naegrin and Tzafir stated that one of the causes of employee turnover intention behaviour is triggered by organisations that cannot meet employee opportunities to develop their careers (Shahzad et al., 2011).

The turnover intention dimension the possibility of getting a job outside, in government hospital participants that has the second moderate level with a mean value of 2.67 is. While in private hospital participants this dimension is the third moderate level with a mean value of 2.75. This means that participants have the desire to get another job that better suits their needs and has the same compensation as the current on the intention to be elsewhere with a different job.

For participants from government hospitals to find another job by giving up their status as government employees will think again. The culture in Indonesia that being a government employee is a dream or desire of everyone in general makes them tend to survive or look for other departments without giving up their status as government employees. Research by Yatnikasari, 2010 explained that one of the reasons for leaving their current workplace without having to give up their status as

government employees is by moving to the ministry of health (not in the health service) moving to another government hospital.

Meanwhile, for nurses from private hospitals to get another job that is better than before requires greater effort, has competence and a positive track record in their work and requires relationships and connections that really know their competence. For private nurses, changing jobs outside of their current job is relatively difficult to do if they do not have this.

Research by Hu et. al. 2022, found that nurses will devote more energy and be more enthusiastic about their work when they positively identify their careers. Career identity can help them overcome difficulties and problems that cause dissatisfaction and strengthen their commitment to stay.

CONCLUSIONS

Turnover intention among nurses in government and private hospitals showed different patterns, although both were at moderate levels. Nurses in government hospitals tend to have lower turnover intention due to job stability and benefits offered as civil servants, such as welfare and pension guarantees. In contrast, nurses in private hospitals show a higher level of turnover intention, which may be due to dissatisfaction with working conditions and unmet personal needs. Although there is a desire to find a new job in both groups, government nurses prefer to stay in their jobs, while private nurses are more likely to consider moving elsewhere. Factors such as job stress, lack of managerial support, and dissatisfaction with compensation contribute to this exit intention. Overall, it is important for hospital management to understand these factors that influence turnover intention in order to develop effective retention strategies, improve job satisfaction, and reduce costs associated with recruiting and training new nurses.

REFERENCES

- Affandi, lutfi. (2014). KONTRAKSI HUBUNGAN ANTARA TURNOVER INTENTION DENGAN TURNOVER. *Telaah Manajemen*, II(1), 13–25.
- Asghar M, Tayyab M, Gull N, Zhijie S, Shi R, Tao X. Polychronicity, work engagement, and turnover intention: the moderating role of perceived organizational support in the hotel industry. *J Hosp Tour Manag*. 2021;49:129–139. doi:10.1016/j.jhtm.2021.09.004
- Boamah AS, Laschinger H. The influence of areas of worklife fit and work–life interference on burnout and turn- over intentions among new graduate nurses. *J Nurs Manag*. 2016;24:E164-E174.
- Bothma CF, Roodt G. Validasi skala turnover in- tention. *SA Jurnal Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* . 2013. 2013;11(1): 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.4102/sajhrm.v11i1.507>
- Chen, X., Ran, L., Zhang, Y., Yang, J., Yao, H., Zhu, S., & Tan, X. (2019). Moderating role of job satisfaction on turnover intention and burnout among workers in primary care institutions: a cross- sectional study. *BMC public health*, 19(1), 1-10.
- Fernandez, R., Lord, H., Halcomb, E., Moxham, L., Middleton, R., Alananzeh, I., & Ellwood, L. (2020). Implications for COVID-19: A systematic review of nurses' experiences of working in acute care hospital settings during a respiratory pandemic. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 111, 103637. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2020.103637>
- Gillies, D. (1994). *Nursing Management: A Systems Approach* (third edition). W.B. Saunders Company.
- Halimah, T. N., Fathoni, A., & Maria M Minarsih. (2016). LINGKUNGAN KERJA TERHADAP TURNOVER INTENTION PRAMUNIAGA Di GELAE SUPERMARKET (Studi Kasus Pada Gelael Superindo Kota Semarang). *Journal of Management*, 2(2).
- Hay, M. (2002). Strategies for survival in the talent war. *Career Development International*, 7(1), 52- 55. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/13620430210414883>
- Hu, H., Wang, C., Lan, Y., & Wu, X. (2022). *Nurses' turnover intention, hope and career identity: the mediating role of job satisfaction*. *Nurses BMC* , 21 (1), 1-11.
- Kusumawati, E., Sofiah, D., & Prasetyo, Y. (2021). Keterikatan kerja dan tingkat Turnover Intention pada karyawan generasi milenial dan generasi Z. *SUKMA: Jurnal Penelitian Psikologi*, 2(2), 100-111.
- Lambert, E. G., Solinas-Saunders, M., Haynes, S. H., May, D. C., Keena, L. D., Leone, M., & Buckner, Z. (2023). The association of organizational justice views and turnover intent among correctional staff. *Criminal Justice Studies*, 36(4), 396–417. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1478601X.2023.2239994>
- Novliadi, F. (2007). Intensi turnover karyawan ditinjau dari budaya perusahaan dan kepuasan kerja. Medan: Universitas Sumatera Utara.
- Nursing Solutions Inc, N. (2023). 2023 National Health Care Retention & RN Staffing Report. *NSI Nursing Solutions, Inc*, 717, https://www.nsinursingsolutions.com/Documents/Library/NSI_National_Health_Care_Retention_Report.pdf
- Oktizulvia, C., Dachriyanus, D., & Vionalisa, V. (2017). Job Satisfaction Factors and Nurses Intention to Quit in Type C Hospitals. *Journal of Nursing & Care*, 06(03). <https://doi.org/10.4172/2167-1168.1000399>
- Putri et al. (2023) The Influence Of Job Satisfaction And Job Stress Work On Turnover Intention In CV. Zharry Home Creative. *Journal of Management, Economic, and Accounting*, Vol. 2No. 2 July-December 2023 page: 349–360
- Sabatini, M.S.N. et al. 2023. TURNOVER INTENTION PERAWAT DI RUMAH SAKIT. *Jurnal Surya Muda*. 5, 1 (Feb.

- 2023), 104–109.
DOI:<https://doi.org/10.38102/jsm.v5i1.150>.
- Sukma, B. A., Supiyanto, & Retnaningsih, D. Y. (2020). Hubungan Turnover Intention Dengan Kinerja Perawat Di Ruang Rawat Inap Rumah Sakit Mitra Kasih Cimahi. *Jurnal Kesehatan Budi Luhur*, 13(2), 330–336.
- Steffi, M., Sabatini, N., Dwiantoro, L., Dewi, N. S., Keperawatan, D. I., Kedokteran, F., & Diponegoro, U. (2023). *Turnover Intention Perawat Di Rumah Sakit Nurse Turnover Intention in Hospital* (Vol. 5, Issue 1).
- Muharni, S., & Wardhani, U. (2020). Analisa Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Terjadinya Turnover Intention Perawat di Rumah Sakit Santa Elisabeth Kota Batam. *Jurnal Kesehatan Saelmakers Perdana (JKSP)*, 3(2), 236–245.
- Muhadi & Angesti (2022). Pengaruh *Work Life Balance* Dan Stres Kerja Terhadap *Turnover Intention* Pada Perawat Di RSI Surabaya. *Jurnal Keperawatan Muhammadiyah* 7 (3) 2022
- Muslim, A., & Sutinah, S. (2020a). Pengembangan Karier Profesional Perawat Non PNS Di Rumah Sakit X. *Jurnal Manajemen Kesehatan Yayasan RS.Dr. Soetomo*, 6(1), 16. <https://doi.org/10.29241/jmk.v6i1.262>
- Muslim, A., & Sutinah, S. (2020b). Program Retensi Perawat untuk Mengurangi Turnover Perawat Non PNS di Rumah Sakit X. *Jurnal Ners Dan Kebidanan (Journal of Ners and Midwifery)*, 7(2), 162–169. <https://doi.org/10.26699/jnk.v7i2.art.p162-169>
- Yatnikasari, A. (2010) *Hubungan Program Retensi Dengan Komitmen Organisasi Perawat Pelaksana Di RSAB Harapan Kita*.
- Zhang Y, Han W, Qin W, et al. Levels of compassion satisfaction, compassion fatigue and burnout in nursing: a meta-analysis. *J Nurs Manag.* 2018;26(7):810-819.